

National Highways & Infrastructure Development Corporation Ltd.

Minutes of Meeting of Empowered Technical Bid Evaluation Committee (ETEC) dated 19.03.2018 for "Consultancy Services for Preparation of Detailed Project Report and providing Pre-Construction activities:

- (i) For construction of Approach Roads with Avalanche Protection Works to West and East portal of the proposed Zojila Tunnel between (between Baltal and Minamarg) from km 82.00 to km 95.00 on Srinagar-Leh road (NH-1) and;
- (ii) For making the NH-1 from Z-Morh Tunnel to proposed Zojila Tunnel (approx. 20 km) all weather road in the State of Jammu & Kashmir"- **Second Stage Evaluation.**

The following firms submitted their bids for the subject project by due date and time.

- (i) M/s. SMEC International Pty Ltd. in JV with SMEC (India) Pvt. Ltd in Association with Anandjiwala Technical Consultancy.
- (ii) Aushta Consulting Engineering Pvt. Ltd. In Association with Rodic Consultants Pvt. Ltd.

2. The scores of the firms towards second stage evaluation and the list of the technically qualified bidders were uploaded on online portals giving opportunity to the bidders to respond within 16.03.2018 (1500 hrs). The bidders have since submitted their representation by due date and time.

3. The Committee met on 19.03.2018 to discuss and deliberate on the representation submitted by the bidders. The second stage evaluation of these two firms was checked and modified on the basis of the representation submitted by the bidders. The breakup of the revised Second Stage Evaluation is enclosed at **Annexure-I.**

3.1 M/s. SMEC International Pty Ltd. in JV with SMEC (India) Pvt. Ltd in Association with Anandjiwala Technical Consultancy:

Description	Claims of the bidder	NHIDCL's consideration
Experience in LIDAR or equivalent technology for topographic survey	The bidder has informed that Project no. 1 & 2 has been executed under separate work orders but the client has provided with a composite completion certificates. As a proof, the bidder has enclosed the two work orders for reference.	Considered.
Experience in using GPR and Induction Locator or equivalent technologies for detection of sub surface utilities	A fresh certificate issued for Project No. 1 as per the satisfaction of the Client has been submitted by the bidder for its consideration.	Considered.
Experience in digitization of cadastral maps for land acquisition	The bidder has requested to evaluate Project no. 10, 11 & 23 uploaded on INFRACON portal of SMEC International Pty. Ltd. And Project no. 34 on SMEC (India) Pvt. Ltd. The bidder has stated that all the projects (except for Project no. 10) have been clearly stated as "YES" for Involvement of Digitization of Cadastral Maps for Land Acquisition. In regards to project no. 10, the bidder has	The projects at Sl. No. 10, 11 and 23 have only been considered after examination, for which the bidder has been awarded 3 extra marks. Project no. 10 has been considered as the

Lil

over

3 Mike

M

	stated that as any amendments over INFRACON Profile is blocked that's why they were unable to change the NO to YES. To justify the same, the bidder stated that he had submitted the documents in the hard copy submitted along with original bid.	bidder has submitted relevant documents in the hard copy submitted along with the original bid. Project no. 34 has not been considered because the completion certificate is not submitted, instead, a copy of the Contract Agreement is submitted.
Abstract of Key Personnel score		
Mr. Sanjay Kumar Panda Senior Survey Engineer	The bidder has claimed an additional 18 marks instead of 0 against 'Experience in Similar projects (2/4/6 laning of NH/SH/Expressways) in Project Preparation/ Construction/ Construction Supervision', considering INFRACON Project Sl. No. 5 to 20.	INFRACON has not picked up the experience as the Key Personnel has not filled up the details in 2/4/6 lane in the INFRACON input sheet. However, from the details mentioned and the experience certificate provided, it is clear that Mr. Sanjay Kumar Panda has the requisite experience and hence considered.
Mr. Bhavesh Kumar Singh Environmental Specialist	The bidder has claimed an additional 5 marks instead of 0 against 'Post Graduation in Environmental Engineering'. The bidder has also claimed 21 marks instead 17 marks against 'Experience in Highway Projects- Experience in Environment Impact Assessment of Highway Projects (2/4/6 laning of NH/SH/Expressways)'	Not considered since the Key Personnel is a Phd in Environmental Science whereas we require Post Graduation in Environmental Engineering. Considered.
Mr. Mrugesh Anandjiwala Material cum Geotechnical cum Geologist	The bidder has claimed 21 marks instead of 0 against 'Experience in Highway Projects-in Similar Projects (2/4/6 laning of NH/SH/Expressways) in design and or Construction/Construction Supervision'.	INFRACON has not picked up the experience as the Key Personnel has clicked on 'Other works' instead of 'Supervision/ DPR/Feasibility cum Preliminary study'. However, from the details mentioned and the experience certificate provided, it is clear that Mr. Mrugesh Anandjiwala has the requisite experience and hence considered.

h.l

over

3 Mike

3.2 Aushta Consulting Engineering Pvt. Ltd. In Association with Rodic Consultants Pvt. Ltd.

Description	Claims of the bidder	NHIDCL's consideration
Aggregate length of DPR/Feasibility study for expressways for 2/4/6 lane in the hilly and mountainous terrain above MSL of 2000 mtrs.	In support of the response that the project "Consultancy Services for Detailed Project Preparation (DPR) for two lane roads to hydropower project site (SH: road from 9 th mile of Bomdila-Dirang road to Nafra – 36 km) in the state of Arunachal Pradesh". is located in the hilly/mountainous terrain above MSL of 2000 mtrs, the bidder has submitted fresh certificate from the Client that the project is passing through place called Bomdila which is at 2217 mtrs elevation.	The project claimed by the bidder has been now considered since the bidder has submitted the certificate from the client stating that the project stretch passes through the region having altitude more than 2000 meter above MSL. Although the bidder has not provided the coordinates of the region as asked, based on the certificate, the same has been considered. The total marks awarded against 'Firm's Relevant Experience in the Last 7 Years' thus comes out to be 14 instead of 12.
Experience in LIDAR or equivalent technology for topographic survey	During second stage evaluation, it was found that the 3 works uploaded separately on INFRACON for claiming the experience of LIDAR survey, are issued under same contract. The bidder has attached a certificate in which the authority certified that all 3 projects were awarded under separate work orders.	In respect of Experience in LIDAR or equivalent technology for topography, experience in using GPR & Induction Locator or equivalent technologies for detection of surface utilities and digitization of cadastral maps for local acquisition, the bidder has submitted the certification from the Faridabad Municipal Corporation (FMC) duly signed by the Planning Assistant, stating that the works claimed belonged to separate work orders. Considering the same, the marks against 'Equipment and software' has increased to 20 from 15.
Experience in using GPR and Induction Locator or equivalent technologies for detection of sub surface utilities	As per above mentioned issue, the bidder has claimed revision of the marks assessed keeping in consideration that the 3 projects were awarded under separate work orders.	
Experience in digitization of cadastral maps for land acquisition	As per above mentioned issue, the bidder has claimed revision of the marks assessed keeping in consideration that the 3 projects were awarded under separate work orders.	
Abstract of Key Personnel score		
Mr. Tapas Mazumder Highway cum Pavement Engineer	The bidder has claimed an additional 5 marks against 'Employment with the firm'.	Not considered.
Mr. Nadeem Ahmed Senior Bridge Engineer	The bidder has claimed an additional 5 marks instead of 0 against 'Post Graduation in Structural Engineering/Bridge Engineering'.	Not considered since the certificate does not mention the specialization branch of Civil Engineering.
Mr. Raj Kumar Dhawan Material Engineer cum Geotechnical Engineer-Geologist	The bidder has claimed an additional 5 marks instead of 0 against 'Post Graduation in Foundation Engineering/Soil Mechanics/Geotech Engineering or Phd in Geology'. The bidder has also claimed an additional 5 marks against 'Employment with the firm'.	Not considered since the certificate does not mention the specialization branch of Civil Engineering. Considered.

h.l

One

(3/4)

h

Mr. Sudipta Chatterjee Senior Survey Engineer	The bidder has claimed an additional 5 marks against 'Knowledge and understanding of modern computer based method of surveying'.	Not considered since the bidder has clearly stated 'NO' against the same qualification, in his CV in INFRACON.
Mr. Sunil Kumar Environmental Specialist	The bidder has claimed an additional 5 marks against 'Experience as Environmental Specialist or in similar capacity in Highway Projects (2/4/6 laning of NH/SH/Expressways)'.	Not considered since the Completion dates for the claimed projects are not given and it is not clear whether the projects are completed or not.

4. The summary of the technical scores, thus works out to be as follows:

S. No.	Firm's Name	Firm's Relevant Experience In The Last 7 Years	Equipment and software	Qualifications and Competence of the Key Staff for the assignment	Adequacy Marks for Work Plan and Methodology	Total Max Marks
		(Max. points 25)	(Max. points 20)	(Max. points 50)	(Max. points 5)	(Max. points 100)
1	M/s. SMEC International Pty Ltd. in JV with SMEC (India) Pvt. Ltd in Association with Anandjiwala Technical Consultancy.	24	16	46.55	5	91.55
2	Aushta Consulting Engineering Pvt. Ltd. In Association with Rodic Consultants Pvt. Ltd.	14	20	45.5	5	84.50

5. In view of the above, ETEC recommended that both the firms as follows qualify for the Financial Bid Opening:


- (i) M/s. SMEC International Pty Ltd. in JV with SMEC (India) Pvt. Ltd in Association with Anandjiwala Technical Consultancy.
- (ii) Aushta Consulting Engineering Pvt. Ltd. In Association with Rodic Consultants Pvt. Ltd.

6. The Committee proposed that the final technical scores of the second stage evaluation shall be made available on the online portal, subsequent to which the Financial Bids of the qualified consultants shall be opened.

Meeting ended with vote of thanks to the chair.


Sh. Sanjeev Malik
Executive Director-III
(Convenor)


Sh. Pradeep Sharma,
GM (Tech.)
(Member Secretary)


Sh. Adil Singh
GM (Tech.)
(Member)


Sh. Uttam Chatterjee,
Dy. General Manager (Fin.)
(Member)

Consultancy Services for Preparation of Detailed Project Report and providing Pre-Construction activities (1) For construction of Approach Roads with Avalanche Protection Works to West and East portal of the proposed Zojila Tunnel between (between Baltal and Minamarg) from km 82.00 to km 95.00 on Srinagar-Leh road (NH-1) and (2) For making the NH-1 from Z-Morh Tunnel to proposed Zojila Tunnel (approx. 20 km) all weather road in the State of Jammu and Kashmir[NHIDCL/JandK/ Zojila-Approach Road/DPR/NH-1/2017]					
Second Stage Technical Evaluation (Annexure-I)					
Summary Of Technical Support					
Company Name	Firm's Relevant Experience In The Last 7 Years	Equipment and software	Qualifications and Competence of the Key Staff for the assignment	Adequacy Marks for Work Plan and Methodology	Total
	(Max. points 25)	(Max. points 20)	(Max. points 50)	(Max. points 5)	(Max. points 100)
Unique Team ID: 2018-461-740_9278 SMEC International Pty. Ltd. in JV with SMEC (India) Pvt. Ltd. in association with Anandjiwala Technical Consultancy	24	16	46.55	5	91.55
Unique Team ID: 2018-461-811_0144 AUSHTA CONSULTING ENGINEERS (INDIA) PVT. LTD. in association with RODIC CONSULTANTS PVT. LTD.	14	20	45.5	5	84.5

h.l

Ok

3 Mike

h

Consultancy Services for Preparation of Detailed Project Report and providing Pre-Construction activities:

(i) For construction of Approach Roads with Avalanche Protection Works to West and East portal of the proposed Zojila Tunnel between (between Baltal and Minamarg) from km 82.00 to km 95.00 on Srinagar-Leh road (NH-1) and;

(ii) For making the NH-1 from Z-Morh Tunnel to proposed Zojila Tunnel (approx. 20 km) all weather road in the State of Jammu & Kashmir

Revised Second Stage Evaluation of Firm's Experience (Max. points = 25)

Sr. No.	Name of Firm	Aggregate Length of DPR / Feasibility study of 2/4/6 lane projects in hilly and mountainous terrain		Team Score	DPR for 2/4/6 laning projects in hilly and mountainous terrain each equal to or more than 40 % of indicative length of a package applied for (or Feasibility Study for 2/4/6 laning projects in hilly and mountainous terrain each equal to or more than 60 % of indicative length of a package applied for)		Team Score	Average Turnover of last 5 Years		Team Score	DPR for bridge projects having length more than 200.001 Meter		Team Score	Aggregate length of DPR/ Feasibility study for expressways for 2/4/6 lane in the hilly and mountainous terrain above MSL of 2000 mtrs	Team Score	Total Score (A)	Total Score as per INFRACON (B)	Increase in INFRACON Score based on Revised Evaluation (A-B)
		As per Infracon	As per revised First Stage Evaluation		As per Infracon	As per revised First Stage Evaluation		As per Infracon	As per revised First Stage Evaluation		As per Infracon	As per revised First Stage Evaluation						
1	M/s. SMEC International Pty Ltd. in JV with SMEC (India) Pvt. Ltd in association with Anandjiwala Technical Consultancy.	3,069.38	219.57	6.00	16	3 projects (Lead: Project no 2 and Other: Project no 2 and 3)	6	1426.31 Cr	1426.31 Cr	4	14	3	3	179.57 (Other: Project no 2 and 3)	5	24.00	20	4.00
2	Aushta Consulting Engineering Pvt. Ltd. In Association with Rodic Consultant Pvt. Ltd.	941.27	144.302	6.00	7	3 projects (Project no. 4, 5 and 8)	6	15398208 .15 Cr	4.286 Cr	0	0	0	0	36 (Project no. 8)	2	14.00	12	-2.00

2/5

2/5

2/5

2/5

(2/5)

Consultancy Services for Preparation of Detailed Project Report and providing Pre-Construction activities (1) For construction of Approach Roads with Avalanche Protection Works to West and East portal of the proposed Zojila Tunnel between (between Baltal and Minamarg) from km 82.00 to km 95.00 on Srinagar-Leh road (NH-1) and (2) For making the NH-1 from Z-Morh Tunnel to proposed Zojila Tunnel (approx. 20 km) all weather road in the State of Jammu and Kashmir[NHIDCL/JandK/ Zojila-Approach Road/DPR/NH-1/2017]

Second Stage Technical Evaluation

Material testing, Survey and investigation equipment and software proposed to be used

Company Name	Availability of inhouse material in-house material testing facility		Field investigation facility		Office Equipment and Software		Experience in LIDAR Or Equivalent Technology for Topographic & Projects (No. of Projects & Corresponding Marks as per RFP)		Experience in using GPR & Induction Locator or Equivalent Technologies for Detection of Sub-Surface Utilities (No. of Projects & Corresponding Marks as per RFP)		Experience in Digitization of Cadastral Map for Local Acquisition (No. of Projects & Corresponding Marks as per RFP)		Total
	(Max. points 2)		(Max. points 3)		(Max. points 3)		(Max. points 4)		(Max. points 4)		(Max. points 4)		(Max. points 20)
	Firm's fulfillment Status	Score	Firm's fulfillment Status	Score	Firm's fulfillment Status	Score	Firm's fulfillment Status	Score	Firm's fulfillment Status	Score	Firm's fulfillment Status	Score	
SMEC International Pty. Ltd.	Available	2	Available	3	Available	3	2	2	3	3	3	3	16
AUSHTA CONSULTING ENGINEERS (INDIA) PVT. LTD.	Available	2	Available	3	Available	3	4	4	4	4	4	4	20

Lil

Oh

White

h

NHIDCL/JandK/ Zojila-Approach Road/DPR/NH-1/2017

Abstract of Key Personnel Score

Company Name:-AUSHTA CONSULTING ENGINEERS (INDIA) PVT. LTD. Team ID:-2018-461-811_0144

Sno	Key Person Name	Position	Age	Key Personnel Score	Key Personnel Weightage %	Team Weightage %	Technical Score	Replacement Details
Central Team								
1	<u>Eesari Suryaprakash Reddy</u>	Traffic and Safety Expert	37	87	6	100	5.22	
Associated Company Name: RODIC CONSULTANTS PVT. LTD.								
Sno	Key Person Name	Position	Age	Key Personnel Score	Key Personnel Weightage %	Team Weightage %	Technical Score	Replacement Details
Central Team								
1	<u>Raj Kumar Dhawan</u>	Material-cum-Geo-technical Engineer-Geologist	54	95	7	100	6.65	
2	<u>Nadeem Ahmed</u>	Senior Bridge Engineer	46	84	7	100	5.88	
3	<u>Tapas Majumder</u>	Highway cum Pavement Engineer	50	90	7	100	6.3	
4	<u>Sudipta Chatterjee</u>	Senior Survey Engineer	42	92	5	100	4.6	
5	<u>Ratneswar Saikia</u>	Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer	62	94	10	100	9.4	
6	<u>Anil Kumar Singh</u>	Quantity Surveyor/Documentation Expert	54	100	3	100	3	
7	<u>Sunil Kumar</u>	Environmental Specialist	48	89	5	100	4.45	
						Total	45.5	

h.l

D.R.

G.M.

4

(4/5)

Abstract of Key Personnel Score

Company Name:-SMEC International Pty. Ltd. Team ID:-2018-461-740_9278

Sno	Key Person Name	Position	Age	Key Personnel Score	Key Personnel Weightage %	Team Weightage %	Technical Score	Replacement Details
-----	-----------------	----------	-----	---------------------	---------------------------	------------------	-----------------	---------------------

Central Team

1	Col. Ravinder Kumar Aima (Retd)	Team Leader cum Senior Highway Engineer	64	95	10	100	9.5	
---	------------------------------------	---	----	----	----	-----	-----	--

Associated Company Name: SMEC (India) Pvt. Ltd.

Sno	Key Person Name	Position	Age	Key Personnel Score	Key Personnel Weightage %	Team Weightage %	Technical Score	Replacement Details
-----	-----------------	----------	-----	---------------------	---------------------------	------------------	-----------------	---------------------

Central Team

1	Aswin Kumar Padhy	Senior Bridge Engineer	60	90	7	100	6.3	
2	K Manoja Kumar Patro	Highway cum Pavement Engineer	43	97	7	100	6.79	
3	RAJEEV ROY	Traffic and Safety Expert	56	88	6	100	5.28	
4	Sanjay Kumar Panda	Senior Survey Engineer	45	94	5	100	4.7	
5	Alok Kumar	Quantity Surveyor/Documentation Expert	44	99	3	100	2.97	
6	Bhavesh Kumar Singh	Environmental Specialist	51	83	5	100	4.15	

Associated Company Name: Anandjiwala Technical Consultancy

Sno	Key Person Name	Position	Age	Key Personnel Score	Key Personnel Weightage %	Team Weightage %	Technical Score	Replacement Details
-----	-----------------	----------	-----	---------------------	---------------------------	------------------	-----------------	---------------------

Central Team

1	Mrugesh Anandjiwala	Material-cum-Geo-technical Engineer- Geologist	63	98	7	100	6.86	
Total							46.55	